WILLS AND ESTATE PLANNING

MATERIALS

ON

WILLS AND SUCCESSION TO PROPERTY

1997-98

Professor R.E. Scane

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
WILLS AND ESTATE PLANNING

MATERIALS
ON
WILLS AND SUCCESSION TO PROPERTY

1997-98

Professor R.E. Scane

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1997 - 1998

## SECTION A: CONTROLS ON THE RIGHT OF DISPOSITION OF PROPERTY ON DEATH

**Part 1:** Rights and Elections of Surviving "Spouses" on Death of a "Spouse" regarding "Net Family Property"

- Family Law Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. F.3, ss. 1, 2(10), 4-7, 14-16  
  A.1.1
  A.1.6

**Part 2:** Protection of Dependants

(A) *The Succession Law Reform Act*

- Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 1(1-3), 57-79  
  A.2.1

(B) *The Applicant*

- Family Law Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. F.3, ss. 1(1), 29-32  
  A.2.7
- *Re Cooper*, (1980), 30 O.R. (2d) 113  
  A.2.8
- *Re Mealey and Broadbent*, (1984), 47 O.R. (2d) 761  
  A.2.12

(C) *The Nature and Extent of the Relief Granted*

- *Re Davies and Davies*, (1979), 27 O.R. (2d) 98  
  A.2.13
  A.2.18
  A.2.27

(D) *Contracts and the Legislation*

  A.2.35

(E) *The Assets Available to Satisfy an Award*

  A.2.45
- *Re Urquhart Estate*, (1990), 74 O.R. (2d) 42  
  A.2.50
  A.2.53
  A.2.54
- *Dunn v. Dunn Estate*, (1992), 8 O.R. (3d) 95  
  A.2.55
**Dunn v. Dunn Estate**, (1993), 12 O.R. (3d) 601 (Divisional Court) A.2.59


(F) *The Power to Vary an Order* A.2.65

(G) *Applicability of Part V of S.L.R.A.* A.2.65

**SECTION B: INTESTATE SUCCESSION IN ONTARIO**

**Part 1: Introduction**

Devolution upon the Personal Representative B.1.1

*Estates Administration Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.22, s. 2* B.1.2

**Part 2: Distribution of Property and Intestacy: Deaths Before March 31, 1978**

(A) *The Spouse* B.2.1

(i) Wife - Preferential Share B.2.1

(ii) Husband - Preferential Share B.2.2

(iii) No Preferential Share where Deceased Survived by Child of Former Marriage B.2.2

(iv) Distributive Share of Wife
    - "Legal Representatives" B.2.3
    - "per Stirpes" distributions B.2.4

(v) Distributive Share of Husband B.2.6

(vi) Effect of Dower on Share of Wife B.2.7

(vii) Effect of Curtesy on Share of Husband B.2.8

(B) *The Lineal Descendants* B.2.9

- "Advancements" to Children B.2.9

(C) *Lineal Ascendants and Collaterals* B.2.10

- Counting Degrees of Relationship B.2.10

- "Representation" B.2.11

- "per capita" distributions B.2.15
Part 3: Distribution of Property on Intestacy: Deaths On and After March 31, 1978

(A) The Succession Law Reform Act

The Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 44-49

(B) Spouses

(C) Children and More Remote Issue

(D) Ascendants and Collaterals

(E) Children Born Out of Wedlock

(i) Abolition of "Illegitimacy"

Children’s Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.12, ss. 1-2

(ii) Enquiries

Estates Administration Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.22, s. 24

(iii) Proof

Children’s Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.12, ss. 3-10, 12

(F) Adopted Children

Child and Family Services Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.11, ss. 158-159

SECTION C: WILLS - THE MAKING AND REVOCATION OF TESTAMENTARY DOCUMENTS

Part 1: General

(A) Succession Law Reform Act

(i) General Definitions

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 1
(ii)  **What May Be Given by Will**

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 2  

C.1.2

(iii)  **Applicability of Part 1 of the Act**

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 43  

C.1.2

(iv)  **The Testamentary Act**

Re MacInnes, [1935] S.C.R. 200  

C.1.3


C.1.6


C.1.10

---

**Part 2: Testamentary Capacity, Undue Influence, and Fraud**

(A)  **Age**

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 8  

C.2.1

(B)  **The "Sound, Disposing Mind"**

*Banks v. Goodfellow* (1870), L.R. 5 Q.B.D. 549  

C.2.1


C.2.10

*Re Davis*, [1963] 2 O.R. 666  

C.2.15

*Parker v. Felgate* (1883), 8 P.D. 171  

C.2.24


C.2.26

(C)  **Onus of Proof as to Testamentary Capacity**

*Barry v. Butlin* (1838), 2 Moo. P.C. 480, 12 E.R. 1089 (P.C.)  

C.2.33

(D)  **Undue Influence, Fraud and "Suspicious Circumstances"**

*Wingrove v. Wingrove* (1885), 11 P.D. 81  

C.2.35

*Craig v. Lamoureux*, [1920] A.C. 349 (P.C.)  

C.2.36


C.2.41

*MacGregor v. Ryan* (1965), 53 D.L.R. (2d) 126  

C.2.64
Wintle v. Nye, [1959] 1 W.L.R. 284 C.2.84
Russell v. Fraser (1981), 118 D.L.R. (3d) 733 C.2.95
Re Worrell, [1970] 1 O.R. 184 C.2.102

Part 3: Making of a Will - Formal Requirements

(A) Conflict of Laws

(i) The Succession Law Reform Act
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 34-41 C.3.1
(ii) The "International Will"
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 42 C.3.2

(B) Special Situations
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 5 C.3.6

(C) "Formal" Wills
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c.S.26, ss. 3, 4, 7 C.3.7

(i) In Writing
Murray v. Haylow, (1927), 60 O.L.R. 535 C.3.8
(ii) Signed at End "by the testator or by some other person in his or her presence and by his or her direction"
Re White, [1948] 1 D.L.R. 572 C.3.9
Re Deeley and Green (1929), 64 O.L.R. 535 C.3.13
(iii) Attestation
Chesline v. Hermiston (1928), 62 O.L.R. 575 C.3.14
Smith v. Smith (1866), 1 P. & D. 143 C.3.16
Re Gunstan (1882), 7 P.D. 102 C.3.17
Re Chalcroft, [1948] P. 222
(iv) Witnesses
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 11-14  
Re Trotter, [1899] 1 Ch. 764  
Thorpe v. Bestwick (1881), 6 Q.B.D. 311  
Re Ray's Will Trusts, [1936] 1 Ch. 521

(D) Holograph Wills
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 6,7  
Re Kinahan (1981), 9 E.T.R. 392  
Re Austin (1967), 61 D.L.R. (2d) 582  
Re Philip (1979), 100 D.L.R. (2d) 582  
Re Forest (1979), 5 E.T.R. 144  
Re Carr Estate (1991), 112 N.B.R. (2d) 151

(E) Incorporation by Reference
In the Goods of Smart [1902] P.238  
Re Mihalopulos (1956), 5 D.L.R. (2d) 628  
Re Coate (1987) 26 E.T.R. 161

Part 4: Revocation or Alteration of Wills

(A) General
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 15-17 (i)  

(B) Revocation by Operation of Law
(i) Subsequent Marriage
Re Langston, [1953] P. 100
Re Pluto (1969), 6 D.L.R. (3d) 541 C.4.4

Re Coleman, [1976] Ch. 1 C.4.6

Layer v. Burns Philp Trustee Co. Ltd., (1986), 6 N.S.W.L.R. 60 C.4.11

(ii) **Wills Made in Exercise of a Power of Appointment**

Re Paul, [1921] 2 Ch. 1 C.4.16

Re Gilligan, [1949] 2 All E.R. 401 (P.D.) C.4.18

(iii) **Divorce**

Re Majetka (1984), 8 D.L.R. (4th) 481 C.4.20


(C) **Revocation by Act of the Testator**

(i) **By Subsequent Testamentary Document: Express or Implied Revocation**

Re Davies, [1928] 1 Ch. 24 C.4.26

Re Robinson, [1930] 2 Ch. 332 C.4.29

Re Bryan, [1907] p. 125 C.4.31

(ii) **By Physical Act**

Cheese v. Lovejoy (1887), L.R. 2 P.D. 251 C.4.34


(iii) **By Alteration to the Will Document**

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 18 C.4.42

Re Itter, [1950] P. 130 C.4.43

King Estate v. King-Fleming (Dec. 11, 1995) C.4.45

(D) **Revocation by Act of the Testator: Conditional Revocation**

( Including Herein the Revival of Previously Revoked Wills)

Giles v. Warren (1872), L.R. 2 P. & D. 401. C.4.48
Part 5: Curative Statutory Provisions


Part 6: Correction of Mistakes in the Will: The Probate Jurisdiction

(A) The Common Law Jurisdiction

Guardhouse v. Blackburn (1866), L.R. 1 P.&D. 109

Re Horrocks, [1939] P. 198

Re Doner (1931), 40 O.W.N. 120


Re Brander, [1952] 4 D.L.R. 688

Re Morris, [1971] P. 62

Re Reynette-James, [1976] 1 W.L.R. 161

Re Phelan, [1972] Fam. 33

Re Tait, [1957] V.R. 405

(B) A Statutory Remedy

Administration of Justice Act 1982 (U.K.), 1982, c. 53, s.20
Note: *Wordingham v. Royal Exchange Trust Co. Ltd.*

(C) *The Jurisdiction of the Court of Construction Compared*

- *Re Craig (1977)*, 14 O.R. (2d) 589 (High Court of Justice)
- *Re Craig (1978)*, 42 O.R. (2d) 567 (Court of Appeal)

**SECTION D: THE CONSTRUCTION OF VALID TESTAMENTARY DOCUMENTS**

**Part 1: General Principles**

- *Re Helliwell,* [1916] 2 Ch. 580
- *Re Cook,* [1948] 1 Ch. 213
- *Dickson v. Campbell* (Ontario Court of Appeal) Nov. 3, 1995

**Part 2: The Testator’s Armchair**

- Note re *Higgins v. Dawson*
- *Higgins v. Dawson,* [1902] A.C. 1
- *Re Glassington,* [1906] 2 Ch. 305
- *Re Ofner,* [1909] 1 Ch. 60
- *Re Smalley,* [1929] 2 Ch. 113
- *Re Jeffery,* [1914] 1 Ch. 375
Part 3: Direct Evidence of Intention


Re Gray, [1934] O.W.N. 17 D.3.3

Re Ray, [1916] 1 Ch. 461 D.3.5

Administration of Justice Act, 1982 (U.K.), 1982, c. 53, s. 21 D.3.7

Re Williams, [1985] 1 W.L.R. 905 D.3.8

Part 4: Problems as to Nature of Property Disposed of By the Will

(A) The Classification of Legacies, and the Consequences Thereof: Ademption and Abatement

Note: Problems Relating to the Disposition of Property Described in the Will D.4.1

Re Willcocks, [1921] 2 Ch. 327 D.4.4

Re Millar (1927), 60 O.L.R. 434 D.4.5


Re Webster, [1937] 1 All E.R. 602 D.4.9

Re Culbertson (1967), 62 D.L.R. (2d) 134 (Saskatchewan Court of Appeal) D.4.11

Re Hunter (1975), 8 O.R. (2d) 399 D.4.13

Mental Health Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. M.7, s. 64 D.4.15

Mental Incompetency Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. M.9, s. 18 (1) D.4.15

Substitute Decisions Act, S.O. 1992, c. 30, s. 36 D.4.15

Advocacy, Consent and Substitute Decisions Statute Law Amendment Act, 1996 D.4.15

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 20 D.4.16

(B) The Time from Which a Will "Speaks" with Respect to Property

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 21, 22 D.4.17

Re Thompson (1919), 45 O.L.R. 520
Re Sikes, [1927] 1 Ch. 365
Re Rutherford (1918), 42 O.L.R. 405
Re Portal and Lamb (1885), 30 Ch. D. 50
Morrison v. Morrison (1885), 10 O.R. 303
Re Forbes (1956), 3 D.L.R. (2d) 653
Re Bird, [1942] O.R. 415

(C) The Possible Effect of the Equitable Doctrine of Conversion

Hicks v. McClure (1922), 64 S.C.R. 361
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 20

(D) Is the Property Really Gone, or Just Disguised?

Re Clifford, [1912] 1 Ch. 29
Re Brems, [1963] 1 O.R. 122
Re Cudeck (1977), 16 O.R. (2d) 337 (C.A.)

Part 5: Some Problems Arising as Change Affects Beneficiaries

(A) Where a Beneficiary Named in the Will Predeceases the Testator: The Doctrine of Lapse

Note on the Doctrine of Lapse
Re Ladd, [1932] 2 Ch.219
Re Mackie (1986), 54 O.R. (2d) 784
Re Greenwood, [1912] 1 Ch.392
Re Cousen's Will Trusts, [1937] 1 Ch. 381
Conveyancing and Law of Property Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.34, s. 13
Re Gamble (1906), 13 O.L.R. 299
Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, s. 31
Doucette v. Fedoruk Estate (1993), 49 E.T.R. 199
(B) **Commorientes Legislation**

Succession Law Reform Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. S.26, ss. 55, 56  
D.5.23

Insurance Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. I.8, ss. 215, 194  
D.5.24

Insurance Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. I.8, ss. 319, 314(1), 314(2)  
D.5.24

(C) **Class Gifts**

(i) **General**

Note: Gifts to Classes  
D.5.25

(ii) **Is the Gift a "Class Gift"?**

D.5.27

**Re Jackson** (1880), 25 Ch.D.162  
D.5.31

D.5.34

**Re Hutton** (1983), 39 O.R. (2d) 622  
D.5.35

**Re Burgess** (1968), 67 D.L.R. (2d) 526  
D.5.38

(iii) **Determining the Membership of the Class: the "Class-Closing Rules"**

**Re Chartres**, [1927] 1 Ch. 466  
D.5.43

**Re Bleckly**, [1951] 1 Ch. 740  
D.5.48

**Latta v. Lowry** (1886), 11 O.R. 517  
D.5.54

D.5.55

**Rogers v. Mutch** (1878), 10 Ch. D. 25  
D.5.58

The Perpetuities Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. P.9, s. 7  
D.5.59

The Trustee Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. T.23, s. 65  
D.5.60

### SECTION E: WILLS AND ESTATES CHECKLIST

Checklist and Notes Prepared by the Professional Standards Committee,  
Law Society of Upper Canada, June, 1995  
E.1.1